NEW IDEAS IN PSYCHOLOGY

An International Journal of Innovative Theory in Psychology

VOLUME CONTENTS
AND AUTHOR INDEX VOLUME 9, 1991

PERGAMON PRESS

Oxford New York Seoul Tokyo

New Ideas in Psychology

An International Journal of Innovative Theory in Psychology

Editors

Pierre Moessinger, 46 Maraîchers, CH-1205 Geneva, Switzerland John Broughton, Dept. of Psychology, Box 33, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, NY 10027, U.S.A.
Richard Kitchener, Dept. of Philosophy, Colorado State University, Fort Collins, CO 80523, U.S.A.

Editorial Assistants: Tod Sloan (Venezuela), John Morss (New Zealand), Jeffrey Atlas (New York), and Helen Haste (England)
Production Editor: Val Lepper, Pergamon Press plc, Oxford

Advisory Editorial Board

L. Apostel, Gent; **F. Bresson,** Paris; **J. S. Bruner,** New York, NY; **M. Bunge,** Montreal; **A. A. El Koussy,** Giza; **J. Fodor,** Cambridge, MA; **H. von Foerster,** Pescadero, CA; **H. Furth,** Washington, DC; **H. Gruber,** New York, NY; **I. J. Good,** Blacksburg, VA; **F. Klix,** Berlin, DDR; **M. Malitza,** Bern; **L. Mann,** Bedford Park, S. Australia; **M. L. Minsky,** Cambridge, MA; **S. Moscovici,** Paris; **G. Pask,** Richmond, U.K.; **H. Sinclair,** Geneva; **G. Stent,** Berkeley, CA; **I. D. Thiam,** Dakar; **J. P. S. Uberoi,** Delhi.

Editorial Board

W. M. Bart, Foundations of Education, Burton Hall, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN 55455, U.S.A.
C. Best, Dept. of Psychology, Teachers College, Columbia University, Box 142, New York, NY 10027, U.S.A.
T. G. R. Bower, Dept. of Psychology, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, U.K.
G. Cellérier, FPSE, Université de Genève, 1211 Genève 4, Switzerland
D. Feldman, Dept. of Psychology, Paige Hall, Tufts University, Medford, MA 02155, U.S.A.
F. Fincham, Dept. of Psychology, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 603 East Daniel Street, Champaign, IL 61820, U.S.A.
D. J. Freeman-Moir, Dept. of Education, Canterbury University, Christchurch, New Zealand
H. Gadlin, Dept. of Psychology, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA 01003, U.S.A.
H. Gardner, Veterans Administration Medical Center, 150 South Huntington Avenue, Boston, MA 02130, U.S.A.
K. G. Gergen, Dept. of Psychology, Swarthmore College, Swarthmore, PA 19081, U.S.A.
A. P. Giorgi, Dept. of Psychology, Duquesne University, Pittsburgh, PA 15219, U.S.A.
R. Harré, Sub-Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford, 10 Merton Street, Oxford OX1 4JJ, U.K.
A. Harris, Dept. of Psychology, Rutgers University, Newark, NJ 07102, U.S.A.
R. Holmes, Dept. of Psychology, London School of Economics, London WC2A 2AE, U.K.
B. Hopkins, Dept. of Developmental Neurology, University Hospital, Oostersongel 59, Groningen, The Netherlands
D. Ingleby, Institute of Developmental Psychology, University of Utrecht, Holland
A. R. Jonckheere, Dept. of Psychology, University College, Gower St., London, U.K.
J. Kockelmans, Dept. of Philosophy, 246 Sparks Building. The Pennsylvania State University, University Park, PA 16802, U.S.A.
D. Kuhn, Dept. of Psychology, Teachers College, Columbia University, P.O. Box 33, New York, NY 10027, U.S.A.
H. M. Lacey, Dept. of Philosophy, Swarthmore College, Swarthmore, PA 19081, U.S.A.
J. Macnamara, Dept. of Psychology, McGill University, Stewart Biological Sciences Bldg., Montreal, PQ, Canada H3A 1B1
J. Margolis, Dept. of Philosophy, Temple University, Philadelphia, PA 19122, U.S.A.
W. Mays, The Journal of the British Society for Phenomenology, 54 Spath Rd, Didsbury, Manchester M20 8GT, U.K.
J. A. Meacham, Dept. of Psychology, State University of New York at Buffalo, Buffalo, NY 14260, U.S.A.
T. Natsoulas, Dept. of Psychology, University of California, Davis, CA 95616, U.S.A.
J. Russell, Dept. of Psychology, University of Liverpool, P.O. Box 147, Liverpool LG9 3BX, U.K.
P. F. Secord, College of Education, University of Houston, University Park, Houston, TX 77004, U.S.A.
A. Sloman, Cognitive Studies Programme, University of Sussex, Brighton BN1 9QN, U.K.
E. Sober, Museum of Comparative Zoology, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA 02138, U.S.A.
J. Vonèche, FPSE, Université de Genève, CH-1211 Genève 4, Switzerland
R. Wozniak, Dept. of Education, Bryn Mawr College, Bryn Mawr, PA 19010, U.S.A.
R. Zayan, Dept. de Psychologie experimentale, Université de Louvain, B-1348 Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium

Publishing. Subscription and Advertising Offices: Pergamon Press plc, Headington Hill Hall, Oxford OX3 0BW, U.K. ((0865) 794141: Fax: (0865) 60285) and Pergamon Press Inc, 395 Saw Mill River Road, Elmsford, NY 10523, U.S.A.

Subscription Rates Annual Institutional Subscription Rate (1992): £115.00 (U.S. $210.00). Two-year Institutional Rate (1992/93): £218.50 (U.S. $399.00). Sterling prices are definitive. U.S. dollar prices are quoted for convenience only, and are subject to exchange rate fluctuation. Personal subscription rate for those whose library subscribes at the regular rate is available on request. Prices include postage and insurance and are subject to change without notice. Subscription rates for Japan are available on request.
Microform subscriptions and back issues: Back issues of all previously published volumes, in both hard copy and on microform, are available direct from Pergamon offices.

Published 3 times a year in March, July and November

Copyright © 1992 Pergamon Press plc

It is a condition of publication that manuscripts submitted to this journal have not been published and will not be simultaneously submitted if published elsewhere. By submitting a manuscript, the authors agree that the copyright for their article is transferred to the copyright owner if and when the article is accepted for publication. However, assignment of copyright is not required from authors who work for organizations which do not permit such assignment. The copyright covers the exclusive rights to reproduce and distribute the article, including reprints, photographic reproductions, microform or any other reproductions of similar nature and translations. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, electrostatic, magnetic tape, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without permission in writing from the copyright holder.

Whilst every effort is made by the publishers and editorial board to see that no inaccurate or misleading data, opinion or statement appear in this journal, they wish to make it clear that the data and opinions appearing in the articles and advertisements herein are the sole responsibility of the contributor or advertiser concerned. Accordingly, the publishers, the editorial board and editors and their respective employees, officers and agents accept no responsibility or liability whatsoever for the consequences of any such inaccurate or misleading data, opinion or statement.

CONTENTS

NUMBER 1

FORTHCOMING IN *NEW IDEAS IN PSYCHOLOGY*	i	
ARTICLES		
Rudolf Arnheim	1	Beyond the double truth
Commentaries		
Douglas Sloan	9	Goethe and qualitative knowledge: A response to Arnheim
Derek Wright	13	Knowing and unknowing: A response to Arnheim
Judith M. Burton	17	The aesthetic presence of truth: A response to Arnheim
Fraser N. Watts	21	Cognition, The World, and God: A response to Arnheim
Reed B. K. Howe	25	Introspection: A reassessment
Commentaries		
Thomas Natsoulas	45	"Introspecting" and consciousness: A response to Howe
William Lyons	51	Introspection — A two-level or one-level account?: A response to Howe
K. Anders Ericsson and Robert J. Crutcher	57	Introspection and verbal reports on cognitive processes — Two approaches to the study of thinking: A response to Howe
Robert W. Mitchell	73	Bateson's concept of "metacommunication" in play
IDEAS IN PROGRESS		
Benny Shanon	89	Memory as a tool: An analogy with the guiding stick
BOOK REVIEWS		
Ann Doucette-Gates	95	Moral maps: Kohlberg's contribution: Review of *Lawrence Kohlberg: Consensus and Controversy* edited by Sohan Modgil and Celia Modgil
Alice H. Deakins	107	Advances in gender and language studies: Review of *Language, Gender and Society* edited by Barrie Thorne, Cheris Kramarae, and Nancy Henley
Anastasia Tryphon	113	The unbearable complexity of thinking: Review of *Notebooks of the Mind: Explorations of Thinking* by Vera John-Steiner
Jacques Montangero	117	Dream research: An important contribution to cognitive psychology?: Review of *Dreaming: A Cognitive–Psychological Analysis* by D. Foulkes and *Cognition and Dream Research* edited by R. Haskell
ERRATUM	127	
EDITORIAL ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	I	

NUMBER 2

Special Issue

Mario Bunge on Nonscientific Psychology and Pseudoscience: A Debate

EDITORIAL	129	
ARTICLE		
Mario Bunge	131	A skeptic's beliefs and disbeliefs
Commentaries		
James E. Alcock	151	On the importance of methodological skepticism
Eberhard Bauer and Walter v. Lucadou	157	A strawman called "psi"—Or: What is Professor Bunge afraid of?
David Blitz	163	The line of demarcation between science and nonscience: The case of psychoanalysis and parapsychology
Raymond Boudon	171	On two questions: Should man be considered as rational? How to distinguish science from nonscience?
Paul Feyerabend	181	It's not easy to exorcize ghosts
Willis Harman	187	The epistemological foundations of science reconsidered
Germain Kreweras	197	Skepticism and truth
Uwe Laucken	203	The ontology of the natural sciences as a truncheon
Serge Moscovici	215	Reflections and reactions to the credo of a true believer
Meinrad Perrez	227	The difference between everyday knowledge, ideology, and scientific knowledge
René Thom	233	A dangerous illusion
Jacques Van Rillaer	235	Strategies of dissimulation in the pseudosciences
Mario Bunge	245	What is science? Does it matter to distinguish it from pseudoscience? A reply to my commentators

NUMBER 3

FORTHCOMING IN *NEW IDEAS IN PSYCHOLOGY* i

ARTICLES

J. Angelo Corlett 285 Some connections between epistemology and cognitive psychology

Commentaries

Steve Fuller 307 One small step for naturalized epistemology, one giant leap for analytic philosophy: A response to Corlett

Frederick F. Schmitt 315 How is psychology relevant to epistemology?: A response to Corlett

John D. Greenwood 321 Naturalized epistemology and experimental psychology: A response to Corlett

J. Angelo Corlett 327 Epistemology and experimental cognitive psychology: A reply to Fuller, Schmitt, and Greenwood

Alex Kozulin 335 Life as authoring: The humanistic tradition in Russian psychology

Jacques Montangero 353 Dream production mechanisms and cognition

Continuing commentaries

Leo Apostel 367 Elusive recursiveness — The necessity of a dynamic and pragmatic approach: A response to Vitale

Michael Kelly 375 On Habermas on Freud: A response to Lichtman

R. B. K. Howe 383 Reassessing introspection: A reply to Natsoulas, Lyons, and Ericsson and Crutcher

INTERVIEW

John Shotter 395 Making sense of the world: An interview with **David Krantz**

BOOK REVIEWS

Roger A. Myers 403 Being and choosing: Review of *Deciding: Self-deception in Life Choices* by Tod Sloan

Justin Hecht 405 Brilliant nihilism: Review of *The Mastery of Reason: Cognitive Development and the Production of Rationality* by Valerie Walkerdine

Betty Reardon 409 The range of human potentialities: Review of *Societies at Peace: Anthropological Perspectives* edited by Signe Howell and Ray Willis

AUTHOR INDEX

Alcock, J. E. 151
Apostel, L. 367
Arnheim, R. 1

Bauer, E. 157
Blitz, D. 163
Boudon, R. 171
Bunge, M. 131, 245
Burton, J. M. 17

Corlett, J. A. 285, 327
Crutcher, R. J. 57

Deakins, A. H. 107
Doucette-Gates, A. 95

Ericsson, K. A. 57

Feyerabend, P. 181
Fuller, S. 307

Greenwood, J. D. 321

Harman, W. 187
Hecht, J. 405
Howe, R. B. K. 25, 383

Kelly, M. 375
Kozulin, A. 335
Kreweras, G. 197

Laucken, U. 203
Lyons, W. 51

Mitchell, R. W. 73
Montangero, J. 117, 353
Moscovici, S. 215
Myers, R. A. 403

Natsoulas, T. 45

Perrez, M. 227

Reardon, B. 409

Schmitt, F. F. 315
Shanon, B. 89
Shotter, J. 395
Sloan, D. 9

Thom, R. 233
Tryphon, A. 113

v. Lucadou, W. 157

Van Rillaer, J. 235

Watts, F. N. 21
Wright, D. 13

AIMS AND SCOPE

There is a growing dissatisfaction with fragmentation in theoretical psychology and without doubt there is a felt need for a journal containing articles which aim to integrate these fragmented ideas and theories. Since the usual methods and perspectives have failed to achieve such integration, common sense suggests that we try new and more daring hypotheses.

We place particular emphasis on the fact that informed discussion of psychological theories needs to be interdisciplinary. We are intrigued by the possibility of facilitating a *rapprochement* between traditions of thought that currently ignore each other. We also anticipate that fresh ideas may come from research in fields indirectly related to psychology.

New Ideas in Psychology is devoted to innovative theory in psychology. It does this in several ways; by dealing with

How new ideas develop: conceptual issues in theory construction, scientific creativity and growth of knowledge;

Exploratory theorizing: broad problems in any field of psychology, focusing on new and plausible hypotheses;

Ideas in progress: heuristic insights, suggestive or intriguing speculations.

New Ideas in Psychology provides a forum for theorizers. It is open to letters, comments or debate, and puts a special emphasis on seminal and controversial ideas. Empirical papers are welcome, but only as long as they focus on conceptual issues and are theoretically creative.

INSTRUCTIONS TO AUTHORS AND COMMENTATORS

Five types of article are included in *New Ideas in Psychology*.

(1) How New Ideas Develop

Articles dealing with conceptual issues in theory construction, scientific creativity and growth of knowledge.

(2) Exploratory Theorizing

Unusually significant theoretical articles integrating subfields of psychology.

Novel interpretations, or syntheses, of existing theoretical work.

(3) Ideas in Progress

Tentative and sketchy hypotheses which are not fully developed but which seem to be fruitful and promising.

(4) Book Reviews

Thoughtful essays on current volumes of theorizing in psychology.

(5) Interviews

Controversial articles can be accompanied by solicited discussion papers and a rebuttal by the author, Occasionally, an article that substantially contradicts well-established aspects of current theory can be submitted to multiple peer commentary.

Length: Type (1) and (2) papers should not exceed 25 typewritten pages. (Solicited articles may be longer.) Papers must have an abstract of no more than 15 lines.

Discussion papers and interviews should not exceed 10 typewritten pages.

Type (3)–(5) manuscripts should not exceed 15 typewritten pages. Rebuttals and peer commentaries should comprise 2–4 typewritten pages.

Style: The significance of articles published in *New Ideas in Psychology* should be apparent to readers outside the field of psychology. Therefore, a special effort towards clarity should be made. Jargon and wordiness are to be avoided.

Manuscripts

Only original papers which have not been submitted elsewhere will be considered.

The manuscript should be submitted in triplicate (double spaced, one side only with generous margins) and sent to the appropriate Editor (see below).

The first page of each paper should carry the title, the authors' names and affiliations, and their full current address. The rest of the manuscript should not identify the author in any way.

Contributors are advised to retain an additional copy for themselves as the Editors cannot accept responsibility for damage to or loss of papers submitted.

The journal will accept only papers submitted in English.

All necessary illustrations should accompany the typescript and should be on separate sheets. All photographs, diagrams and charts should be referred to as figures and marked consecutively in the order in which they appear in the text. Each figure must be marked on the back with the name/s of the author/s, the title of the paper and an arrow pointing to the top of the figure. The captions for all figures should be typed together on one sheet of paper headed 'captions to figures'. Photographs should be unmounted black and white glossy prints. Line diagrams should be drawn in black Indian ink on A4 white paper or white board. Lines should be of sufficient thickness and lettering of sufficient size to allow for reduction. Typewritten lettering does not reproduce satisfactorily. Lettering should be done in pencil if it cannot be done in a style suitable for reproduction.

Tables should be as few as possible and include only essential data. They should be given an Arabic numeral, e.g. Table 3, and referred to in the text. Table headings should be numbered as a separate set from figures and typed on a single sheet. Each table should be typed on a single sheet; vertical lines should not be drawn.

References should follow the style given in the *Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association* (3rd ed., pp. 115–133), see examples below:

Journal

Pavio, A. (1975). Perceptual comparisons through the mind's eye. *Memory & Cognition*, **3**, 635–647.

Book

Gurman, A. S., & Kniskern, D. P. (1981). Family therapy outcome research: Knowns and unknowns. In A. S. Gurman, & D. P. Kniskern (Eds.), *Handbook of family therapy* (pp. 742–775). New York: Brunner/Mazel.

References should contain the names of all authors with their initials, the title of the paper, the name of the Journal in full, the volume number, the inclusive page numbers, and the year of publication.

Proofs will be sent to the first-named author. Corrections to proofs should be restricted to printer's errors as far as possible; substantial changes may be charged to the author. Reprints may be ordered on the reprint order form which will accompany the proofs sent to the author (25 free reprints will be supplied free-of-charge for each paper published).

The original manuscript and diagrams will be discarded one month after publication, unless the Publisher is requested to return the original material to the author.

Submission: Type (1) papers should be submitted to R. F. Kitchener, Department of Philosophy, Colorado State University, Fort Collins, CO 80523, U.S.A.

Type (2) articles should be submitted to P. Moessinger, 46 Maraichers, CH-1205 Geneva, Switzerland. Type (3)–(5) manuscripts should be submitted to J. M. Broughton, Department of Psychology, Box 33, Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, NY 10027, U.S.A.

Personal computers: Authors with access to an Apple IIc/e/GS, IBM PC or compatible personal computer are encouraged to use *Manuscript Manager/APA Style*, a software program available from Pergamon Press, Inc., that automatically formats manuscripts according to APA requirements.

Printed in Great Britain by Nuffield Press